Social Computing to Enhance Public Engagement in Urban Design at Scale

Narges Mahyar
Postdoctoral Researcher
Design Lab, UC San Diego

nmahyar@ucsd.edu
Projects, papers, and more:
http://nmahyar.ucsd.edu
Planning problems are wicked

Dilemmas in a General Theory of Planning*

HORST W. J. RITTEL
Professor of the Science of Design, University of California, Berkeley

MELVIN M. WEBBER
Professor of City Planning, University of California, Berkeley

- Unstructured: difficult to sort out causes and effects
- Cross-cutting: have many overlapping stakeholders
- Relentless: can’t be solved, once and for all

Rittel and Webber, 1973
Why Blacksburg, VA, Is a Best Place to Live

Author and Blacksburg local Melody Warnick gets to the heart of what makes this tight-knit town so special.

By Melody Warnick on January 19, 2018 13:13 PM
Virginia Tech president focuses on growth

- Housing for up to 5,000 additional students
- Problems and advantages of student housing
- Preserving neighborhoods and quality life

By Tonia Moxley tonia.moxley@roanoke.com 381-1675, Jul 5, 2015
Conventional methods are counterproductive

- Achieving genuine participation in planning
- Satisfying the public that they are being heard
- Improving the final decisions
- Incorporating a broad spectrum of the public

JE Innes & DE Booher, 2004
Coronado Bridge in San Diego
By the time the San Diego-Coronado Bridge opened in the summer of 1969, the development of Interstate 5 had left 5,000 homes and businesses destroyed in Barrio Logan. Then the California Highway Patrol announced plans to build a substation below the bridge in 1970.
Why is engaging the public important?

- Local knowledge
- Buy in
- Impact social good
Best practices are workshops and design charrettes
Why design charrettes are hard?

“An impossible problem in an absurdly short time”

Condon, 2007
I build & study human-centered collaborative tools

Collocated

Experts
- Mahyar et al, InfoVis 2012, Top 4 VAST papers
- Mahyar et al, HICSS 2013
- Mahyar & Tory, VAST 2014, Best paper award

Novices
- Mahyar et al, VIS 2015
- Mahyar et al, ISS 2016, Honorable mention award, Outstanding award

Online

- Mahyar et al, CHI 2018
- Design for San Diego (D4SD)
UD Co-Spaces: A Table-Centred Multi-Display Environment for Public Engagement in Urban Design Charrettes


[Honorable Mention Award], ISS 2016

[Outstanding Paper Award], CELA 2017
Urban design processes

Girling, C., Kellett, R., and Johnstone, S., 2006
Problem: lack of tool support during design charrettes

- Integrating data and **visualizations** of information
- Employing **interactive** modes to engage people
- Employing **social** and peer learning

URP: tangible workbench for urban planning and design

John Underkoffler & Hiroshi Ishii, CHI, 1999
Design of digital technology to avoid marginalizing people

- The importance of providing the right information at the right time in understandable formats.

Al-Kodmany 2000, Al-Kodmany 2001
Research questions

‣ How to use collaboration technology & visualization techniques to
  ‣ engage diverse stakeholders,
  ‣ foster collaboration and co-creation,
  ‣ increase understanding of impacts of choices?
6 years human-centered design and development process

This was a long-term interdisciplinary project that started before I arrived at UBC.

1st version: tabletop tool 2nd version: wall display 3rd version: handheld

2010 2012 2016
UD Co-Spaces (Urban Design Collaborative Spaces)
My role

- Lack of engagement with metrics on the wall
- Lack of interactivity and customization to engage ppl
- Lack of personal spaces
- Difficulty interacting in parallel with the 3D view
Method

- Analysis of version 2 deployment in the wild
- Interview with urban planners & facilitators
- Design & development of version 3
- Heuristic evaluation with 3 urban planners
- Formal evaluation (comparative study)
System design & considerations

- Adding personal spaces
- Increasing interaction with wall display
- Building interactive visualizations
- Providing accessible and understandable information
Comparative study
Design context

- Design a neighborhood center within a hypothetical existing single family neighborhood in the suburbs of Vancouver.

- Main Goal:
  - Increasing the walkability of the neighborhood
Study procedure

- 40 participants (groups of 5-6, 17 male, 23 female)
- Total time: 140 min (~45 min for design activity)
- Pre & post survey
- Focus group
- Video recorded sessions
Findings: Tabletop surface increased equity of participation

“Having this tabletop got every stakeholder involved so they can make changes themselves, see those changes right away, [which] promotes collaboration”
Muti-display environment catalyzed discussions

“I definitely really liked how everything was synced, specially with regards to 3D, iPad and table itself”
Visualization dashboard increased analytical ability

“Having indicators in real time definitely altered how we approached the project, we could see the larger impact ... it was almost like stepping out and saying, okay, what did we actually do and what is the impact.”
Main contributions

- UD Co-Spaces was superior than paper-based
- Engaging collaborative environment
- Alternative generation and measurement
- Making information and visualization accessible
Contributions beyond urban design domain

- Potential of touch-based interactions
- Increase interactions, engagement & learning
- Transition novices to experts
How can we scale it up to engage a broader range of stakeholders?
CommunityCrit: Inviting the Public to Improve and Evaluate Urban Design Ideas through Micro-Activities

Narges Mahyar, Michael R. James, Michelle M. Ng, Reginald A. Wu, Steven P. Dow, ACM Human Factors in Computing Systems (CHI 2018).
Face to face methods have many limitations

- Engaging representative stakeholders
- Hearing out people’s comments
- Recording/disseminating comments
Urban design tools require time investment and expertise

Online civic technologies often limited to opinion polling

Research question

- How can we create a system for activities beyond opinion polling that captures quality feedback in a short amount of time?
System design & considerations

- Providing a quick & flexible workflow
- Designing understandable questions
- Providing social interactions
- Sending people directly into quick activities
CommunityCrit allows the public to participate in the urban design process.

By offering a quick and easy way to voice opinions, CommunityCrit empowers anyone to help shape the future of their community.

Currently, we are collecting feedback on an effort to expand the 14th Street Promenade in East Village. The intersection of 14th Street, National Avenue, and Commercial Street—referred to as “El Nudillo,” or “the knuckle”—is envisioned as a pedestrian destination, a place of social gathering, and a celebration of East Village and its surrounding neighborhoods.

What do you think El Nudillo should be? Please click below to contribute your voice!

GET STARTED
Design case: El Nudillo a key intersection in San Diego

Background Info on El Nudillo

The 14th Street Promenade, which was approved by the city in 2016, will be a pedestrian-friendly “green street” extending from City College in the north to the intersection of 14th Street and National Avenue in the south. It will feature widened sidewalks, outdoor furniture, and art, in order to promote social gathering and a unique neighborhood feel. The overarching goal for the 14th Street Promenade is to help create a more sustainable, walkable downtown.

We are now engaging the public and local experts to develop the intersection of 14th Street, National Avenue, and Commercial Street, which marks the end of the 14th Street Promenade. This intersection—known as El Nudillo, or “the knuckle”—is envisioned as a pedestrian destination, a place of social gathering, and a celebration of East Village and its surrounding neighborhoods.
1) Pick an idea

Do An Activity
Please select an option below to begin contributing.

Ideas You Have Worked On
Build a tower
Public Art

Pick an Idea to Work On
Here are three random ideas that were submitted by community members. Select one to complete five activities related to that idea. You are always free to skip activities, and you can switch to a different idea by coming back to this page at any time.

Gateway
Promenade Real

Have an idea?
Add your own idea for the future of El Nudillo.
SUBMIT A NEW IDEA

All done?
Please take this short survey so we can improve the experience of CommunityCrit for other community members.
GO TO EXIT SURVEY

2) Do or skip activities

Idea: Build a tower
Submitted by a workshop participant.

Build a tower in the center of El Nudillo. Sketches of tower concepts as shown.

Question 1/5
How could this idea be improved by taking the following submission into consideration?

Submission
14th Street Promenade Workshop
The height limits of East Village/downtown (440 feet) and Barrio Logan (40 feet) converge here. Height should be treated in a sensitive manner.

— This design guideline was submitted by a project organizer.

Please enter your response here.
3) Submit a new idea

Submit A New Idea

What would you like to see or do at El Nudillo, the intersection of 14th Street and National Avenue, by yourself or with family and friends?

Please enter your response here.

Give your idea a name.

Name your idea.

Upload a main image (optional)

Choose File  No file chosen

SUBMIT

4) View my/all contributions

Ideas

Click on an idea to look at the contributions your fellow community members have made.

Promenade Real

It would be brilliant if the entire length of 14th street was closed to motor traffic and was a truly pedestrian promenade. The only exception could be the small Free Ride carts that could transport people up and down the street. This would not only provide a pleasant safe space for people and pets [...]

DO AN ACTIVITY FOR THIS IDEA

Platform connected with bridges

Instead of making a roundabout we can create a two story triangle platform to avoid a major infrastructure change. It is a platform that works with current traffic, but allows people to walk to get where they need, and creates a green space at the ground level. The three pillars can be lightweight [...]

DO AN ACTIVITY FOR THIS IDEA

Interactive Art

Love to see interactive rotating art with current cultural subjects. A place for exchanging ideas which helps the community grow together. Sample image from a San Francisco public art piece

DO AN ACTIVITY FOR THIS IDEA
Method

- Partnership with a local planning team
- Design and development of the tool
- Deployment in the wild
  - Interview with community members
  - Think aloud
- Interview with urban planners
- Experts’ feedback on people’s contributions
Case Study: Park-to-Park Project

Current

Proposed
Workshop participants willingness to use an online tool

- Willingness (21/21)
- Technological means (21/21)
- “We have always been overlooked, so my community would be very interested in an online tool”
Workshop ideas

Build a tower

Build a tower in the center of El Nudillo. Sketches of tower concepts as shown.

Roundabout

The intersection right now is basically just an empty lot. We could easily make it a roundabout with three crosswalks so that traffic from National Ave and Commercial St can still get around but so people can also use the open space in the center.
Community Crit ideas

Promenade Real

It would be brilliant if the entire length of 14th street was closed to motor traffic and was a truly pedestrian promenade. The only exception could be the small Free Ride carts that could transport people up and down the street. This would not only provide a pleasant safe space for people and pets [...]

EL Parquecito

a densely landscaped small urban park. NO Large sculpture or gateway 'ART' archway JUST a BIG canopy tree and pervious ground cover with native grasses to soften
Empowered community members to provide input

“I don’t have time to go to workshops so it provides opportunity to give feedback”. (P6)

“I liked only having to answer 5 questions. I have conducted lengthy surveys myself and thought them to be excessive to the point of endangering the quality of data collection (respondents get bored, distracted, only want the "reward" etc.)” (P2)
Urban planners saw value in public outreach

“Provides more tools for community outreach and for people to participate, and will give us a chance to present ideas that came out of CommunityCrit back to the public during the next workshop and facilitating a discussion around them.” (E2)
Contributions: Scaling & diversifying public participation

Public Workshop

CommunityCrit
Remaining problems

- Supporting the broader urban design process
- Authoring interface for supporting multiple projects
- Increasing participation
- Addressing marginalized perspectives
- Making sense of people’s input
Problem: difficulty of surfacing the key themes

Promenade Real
It would be brilliant if the entire length of 14th street was closed to motor traffic and was a truly pedestrian promenade. The only exception could be the small Free Ride carts that could transport people up and down the street. This would not only provide a pleasant safe space for people and pets [...] DO AN ACTIVITY FOR THIS IDEA

Interactive Art
Love to see interactive rotating art with current cultural subjects. A place for exchanging ideas which helps the community grow together. Sample image from a San Francisco public art piece DO AN ACTIVITY FOR THIS IDEA

Platform connected with bridges
Instead of making a roundabout we can create a two story triangle platform to avoid a major infrastructure change. It is a platform that works with current traffic, but allows people to walk to get where they need, and creates a green space at the ground level. The three pillars can be lightweight [...] DO AN ACTIVITY FOR THIS IDEA

Build a tower
Build a tower in the center of El Nudillo. Sketches of tower concepts as shown. DO AN ACTIVITY FOR THIS IDEA

Roundabout
Early design to surface the key themes in comments
Short-term: building novel tools to advance digital civics

- Sensemaking of complex civic data
- Tools for consensus building and decision making
- Visual storytelling
## Extending my work in other sociotechnical problems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Novices</th>
<th>Collocated</th>
<th>Online</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mahyar et al, VIS 2015</td>
<td><strong>Top 4 VAST papers</strong></td>
<td>Mahyar, 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahyar et al, ISS 2016, <strong>Honorable mention award, Outstanding award</strong></td>
<td>Mahyar et al, HICSS 2013</td>
<td><strong>D4SD</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahyar &amp; Tory, VAST 2014, <strong>Best paper award</strong></td>
<td>Mahyar et al, CHI 2018</td>
<td><strong>Design for San Diego (D4SD)</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Experts**

- Mahyar et al, InfoVis 2012
- Mahyar et al, HICSS 2013
- Mahyar & Tory, VAST 2014

**Low Engagement**

- Expose
- Involve
- Analyze
- Synthesize
- Decide

**High Engagement**
https://d4sd.org

Design for San Diego's 2017 Civic Challenge

How do we create a San Diego where we all move freely?

GET INVOLVED   OR   LEARN MORE
Long-term: learning science, health informatics

- Design of learning analytics systems
  - Broadening learning analytics for non-specialist users
- Support tools in both online and physical environments
  - Use of multi-touch displays to engage novices
Visualization design for non-specialist users

Infographics to increase everyday people’s engagement
How can art make HCI reach beyond specialist audiences?

How can new programs at the interception of Art and Technology address real world problems?
Thank you!
Social Computing to **Enrich** and **Scale** Public Engagement

Narges Mahyar (nmahyar@ucsd.edu, http://nmahyar.ucsd.edu)

**UD Co_Spaces**

*Enriched* public engagement, increased public’s engagement, enabled alternative visualization and measurement in a short amount of time.

**CommunityCrit**

*Scaled* & diversified public participation, democratized access and empowered public to contribute meaningfully in a short amount of time.